

IEPS, M.A. thesis						
Name:	Diana Temirbulatova					
Dissertation title:	Caspian Gas Supplies: An Opportunity of EU Energy Diversification?					
Scale: 5 - excellent, 4 - good, 3 - satisfactory, 2 - poor, 1 – very poor						
	5	4	3	2	1	
ARGUMENT:						
Clearly defined research question		4				No clearly defined research question
Answers research question		4				Does not answer research question
Well structured	5					Badly structured
Shows theoretical awareness			3			Shows no theoretical awareness
Conceptual clarity		4				Conceptual confusion
Empirically appropriate & robust	5					Full of empirical errors
Logical and coherent	5					Illogical and incoherent
Analytical	5					Descriptive
Critical	5					Uncritical
Shows independent thought		4				Does not show independent thought
SOURCES & USAGE:						
Evidence of reading/research	5					No evidence of reading/research
Effective use of sources/data		4				Ineffective use of sources/data
WRITING STYLE:						
Clear		4				Obscure
Good punctuation		4				Poor punctuation
Grammatically correct		4				Grammatically incorrect
PRESENTATION:						
Appropriate length		4				Too long/short
Good referencing		4				Poor/inconsistent referencing
Good spelling		4				Poor spelling
Good bibliography		4				Poor bibliography

Comments: Diana Temirbulatova has focused on one of the most challenging – and widely discussed – topics of contemporary European energy security. Indeed, over the last decades, the question of Caspian natural gas (and oil) supplies from the Caspian Sea to European markets has caused much academic/expert discussion, as well (geo)political tension in the area covered; depending upon distinctly determined points of view, the question of natural gas supplies from the Caspian bypassing Russian territory has been critically considered either a rescue for European energy security that would considerably loosen its sensible dependency on supplies from Russia, or an utterly futile concern that would have absolutely no significance for Europe in terms of energy security. Characteristically, in both cases, political issues have dominated heavily the ongoing discourse. The reviewed study is a critical attempt at unveiling the economical factors behind the issues of Caspian gas export; a well-balanced attempt that takes into consideration complex (geo)political aspects and is therefore a valuable contribution to the ongoing debate in the global context. The study starts with a short, but quite comprehensive chapter aiming at explaining the notion of energy security; nonetheless, no single attempt is made to put the study into the context of IR theory, which can be considered the study's relative weakness. (However, it's up to discussion to which extent use of IR theoretical framework is inevitable for a study whose focus is primarily on economy/energy security issues). Anyways, the methodological approach used by the author makes sense in any respect. The study has a clear and logical structure that enables her to address virtually all questions of research outlined at the onset of the thesis. The author derives benefit from her first-hand knowledge of the (Caspian, EU) area and its complex peculiarities; hence the study is rich in empirical detail. Throughout the study, Temirbulatova shows significant analytical skills; this aspect is of special importance as the author deals with the "reality in making"; a crucial part of her research is placed within the recent couple of years that haven't been addressed properly in scholarly literature yet. The conclusion made by the author is as critical as comprehensive. Last but not least, the study is characterized by a solid level of English; language-related errors are rather seldom. All in all, I consider the reviewed study a considerable success and would like to ask the author to have the outcome of her research published; it's certainly worth sharing with a broader audience.

Specific Questions for oral defence:

1. How would you assess real chances of Turkmenistan joining the Nabucco project in light of the Gurbanguly Berdimuhamedow's recent statements?

Mark*: A (A)
(výborně)

Signed: Emil Souleimanov

Date: 18th June
2010